



Nigeria Reading and Access Research Activity

Review of the IQE in Bauchi and
Sokoto States

June 2014

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development Nigeria (USAID|Nigeria). It was prepared by RTI International.

Nigeria Reading and Access Research Activity

Review of the IQE in Bauchi and Sokoto States

Contract EHC-E-00-04-00004-00

EdData II Technical and Managerial Assistance, Task Number 26

Task Order Number AID-620-BC-14-00002

Activity Start/End Date: February 14, 2014 to November 13, 2015

June 2014

Prepared for
Tim Curtin, COR
USAID|Nigeria

Prepared by
RTI International
3040 Cornwallis Road
Post Office Box 12194
Research Triangle Park, NC 27709-2194

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

RTI International is one of the world's leading research institutes, dedicated to improving the human condition by turning knowledge into practice. Our staff of more than 3,700 provides research and technical services to governments and businesses in more than 75 countries in the areas of health and pharmaceuticals, education and training, surveys and statistics, advanced technology, international development, economic and social policy, energy and the environment, and laboratory testing and chemical analysis. For more information, visit www.rti.org.

RTI International is a trade name of Research Triangle Institute.

Table of Contents

List of Acronyms	v
I. Introduction	1
I.1 Purpose of the Consultancy	2
I.2 Scope of Work.....	2
I.3 Methodology.....	3
I.4 Main Activities Conducted	4
2. Findings	4
2.1 Integration Framework: Meaning and Practice.....	4
2.2 Institutional Context: MDA Mandates, Roles, and Functional Relationship ...	5
2.3 School Types and Operational Procedures/Guidelines	6
2.4 Curriculum Types and Methods of Delivery	8
2.5 Teacher Recruitment and Selection Criteria	11
2.6 Pupil Enrollment Data and Welfare and Support Packages	12
2.7 School Selection Criteria	13
3. Conclusion	14
3.1 Challenges	15
Annex 1. Questionnaire	16
Annex 2. Criteria for School Selection	22
Annex 3. Type of Support Provided by Each Agency	23
Annex 4. Key Outcomes Associated with Integrated Programs.....	25
Annex 5. School Types, Operation Patterns, and Curriculum Types	26
Annex 6. Persons Contacted	27

List of Acronyms

AIEB	Arabic and Islamic Education Board
ANFEA	Adult and Non-Formal Education Agency
BASOVCA	Bauchi State Orphans and Vulnerable Children Agency
BE	basic education
BED	Bachelor of Education
BSc	Bachelor of Science
CBMC	community, or center- based management committee
CSO	civil society organization
DG	Director General
ESSPIN	Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria
ETF	Education Trust Fund
FOMWAN	Federation of Muslim Women Association of Nigeria
GON	Government of Nigeria
HIS	Higher Islamic Studies
IQE	Integrated Qur’anic Education
IQTE	Integrated Qur’anic/Tsangaya Education
JSS	junior secondary school
LGA	Local Government Authority
LGEA	Local Government Education Authority
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MDA	ministries, departments, and agencies
MORA	Ministry of Religious Affairs
NBEC	National Basic Education Commission
NCE	National Certificate on Education
NEI	Nigeria Northern Education Initiative
NMEC	National Mass Education Commission
OST	Orphans and Vulnerable Children Support Team
QNC	Qur’anic Nursery Class
RARA	Reading Access and Research Activity
SAME	State Agency for Mass Education
SBMC	school-based management committee
SSCE	Senior School Certificate Examination
SUBEB	State Universal Basic Education Board
TOR	terms of reference
UBEC	Universal Basic Education Commission
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WAEC	West African Examination Council

I. Introduction

Islamic education in northern Nigeria dates back to the initial introduction of Islam to the country. There are many types of Islamic schools in Nigeria, defined by curriculum practices, patterns of operation, teaching methodology, and pupils, among other things. Islamic schools fall roughly into three traditional, general categories: Qur'anic, Islamiyya, and Tsangaya schools.

Qur'anic

The curriculum for Qur'anic schools focuses on teaching students the recitation and memorization of the Qur'an. There are four levels of Qur'anic education: studies begin in *kotso* (nursery stage), progress to *tittibiri* (elementary stage), followed by *k'olo* (middle youth stage), and culminate in *gardi* (adolescent/ adult stage).

Islamiyya

Islamiyya schools provide more advanced religious study, including instruction in Qur'anic scriptural and legal/jurisprudence subjects. Some currently offer an academic curriculum that has been approved by the Government of Nigeria (GON) as well, including English, mathematics, social studies, and science. Islamiyya schools are diverse; some are fully supported government institutions, whereas others are informally supported extensions of Qur'anic schools.

Tsangaya

Tsangaya is a Hausa word that means "learning center." Tsangaya is associated with itinerant or boarding institutions often organized by local communities. The Tsangaya education system was part of the education system in northern Nigeria during the pre-colonial period. The majority of Tsangaya students are boys.

These broader categories can be broken down into more types of Islamic schools operating in Nigeria, including the Almajiri, or itinerant schools, Islamiya general, Islamiyya integrated, Ilimi school, Tahfiz, Nuzamiyya, and the like. Each of these provides education within its own operational mandate and according to Islamic injunctions, and some of these schools combine their Islamic curriculum with curricula for secular subjects.

Although there are no reliable data on the number of such schools, the last Integrated Qur'anic Education (IQE) census conducted in Sokoto recorded 5,995 schools with an enrollment estimate of 1,118,835 pupils; no such data were available in Bauchi. However, it is believed that there are enormous numbers of Islamic schools spread across all the communities, surpassing the number of modern secular schools. Enrollment of pupils aged 3 to 16 years is estimated at over 16.7million.

The current governments of Sokoto and Bauchi states are concerned with creating opportunities for children attending Islamic schools to access basic, secular,

education. This process is rather slow, as most Islamic school proprietors and parents have a strong antipathy to such schooling. The state governments therefore must integrate secular subjects into Qur'anic school curricula, thereby building confidence in the teaching among communities and linking Islamic school methods with national education practices.

Various initiatives were put in place through government institutions, agencies, and parastatals with varying mandates aimed at either directly intervening in Islamic schools or indirectly providing avenues for linking with Islamic school proprietors to accelerate the provision of basic secular education.

In Bauchi and Sokoto, as in other states in northern Nigeria, the attempt to provide access to basic education through Islamic schools has involved a number of agencies with sometimes conflicting mandates and overlapping functions. This often brought a confusion of roles and duplication of effort, especially in identifying key intervention activities, curriculum practices, pupil welfare packages, and teacher recruitment and selection processes that might aid in the endeavor.

The basic education intervention requires first a systemic analysis of the typology of the Islamic schools as well as an understanding of the institutional arrangements that can accelerate the integration process. The ultimate goal of the intervention is improved quality provision of secular curricula in Islamic schools.

This study therefore is a systematic analysis of the institutional context of Islamic schools in Nigeria, their types, policy imperatives, agency mandates, teacher issues, pupil enrollment, and general challenges. The way these schools operate—whether they hold class morning or afternoon, whether they board pupils, whether they accept both boys and girls, etc.—is a key consideration in this report and will provide the basis for any intervention.

1.1 Purpose of the Consultancy

The purpose of this consultancy was to assist the Nigeria Reading Access and Research Activity (RARA), funded by the US Agency for International Development (USAID) and implemented by RTI International, in conducting a review of existing policies and processes for integrating formal, secular education opportunities into Islamic religious schools. The work involved a review of literature on the IQE process and consultations with stakeholders in Bauchi and Sokoto states. The expected implementation period was from February to April 2014, during which time the consultant was expected to provide 20 days of support to the project.

1.2 Scope of Work

Specifically, this study was intended to provide guidance to USAID on the scale of religious school participation in Bauchi and Sokoto and on opportunities for integrating formal secular subjects into these schools. The consultants collected information on the following areas:

- Definitions of religious schooling types, including itinerant religious schools
- Numbers of religious schools by typology and enrollment (by gender)
- Federal and state policies on integration of Qur'anic schools
- Ministries, departments, and agencies (MDAs) involved in providing support to schools and type of support offered
- For those schools that are already integrated, information on the curriculum offered, the number of teachers/facilitators by qualification, and additional subsidies received by the institution (infrastructure, materials, student welfare contributions).

The study focused on Bauchi and Sokoto states, although relevant experience from other northern states, specifically Jigawa, Kaduna, and Kano, was captured as part of the background context or for comparing policy responses. This research activity was coordinated in close collaboration with the RARA Chief of Party and Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officer, based in Abuja; the Research Program Coordinators based in Bauchi and Sokoto; Nigerian counterparts; and RTI technical advisors based in the US.

1.3 Methodology

The initial activity conducted for this study was a face-to-face interview with staff in relevant MDAs to discuss all the key issues identified in the Data Capture Template provided at the commencement of the desk review to serve as a guide to which specific areas and issues required data. In addition, items identified in the terms of reference (TOR) used by the Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN) to implement IQE in Bauchi and Sokoto states and information collected from other states supported by ESSPIN (Jigawa, Kaduna, and Kano) were also discussed during the interview.

The consultants developed a data gathering tool (*Annex I*) for use in face-to-face interviews to collect data covering policy and institutional arrangements, school types, organizational patterns, the number of pupils by gender, the number of teachers and teacher qualifications, community participation, and welfare packages and funding sources.

The consultants travelled to the two states and conducted observatory visits to two IQE-supported schools and centers in Sokoto and Bauchi.

Using the data gathering tool, the consultants interviewed a range of different respondents at different locations:

- Staff of the State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB), Adult and Non-Formal Education Agency (ANFEA), Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA), Bauchi State Orphans and Vulnerable Children Agency (BASOVCA), Directorate for Tsangaya Education / partner agencies
- School proprietors and alarammas (malams)
- Civil society organizations (CSOs) working or supporting IQE schools

- State Northern Education Initiative (NEI) focal persons.

1.4 Main Activities Conducted

- Initial consultation with the project team to establish the scope and scale of the desk study
- Establishment of a categorization/framework to create a typology of religious schools
- Collection of data on schools by
 - organizational structure and enrollment
 - curriculum and curriculum delivery
 - infrastructure and social welfare
 - Government-provided support (monetized and in-kind)
- Review of state policy(ies) and inter-institutional coordination to identify initiatives supporting integration of Qur'anic schools

2. Findings

2.1 Integration Framework: Meaning and Practice

Integration is a term often defined in two ways when applied to Qur'anic education in Nigeria: bringing the Qur'anic schools into secular system, or introducing the secular curriculum into Qur'anic schools. The former is problematic and elicits some degree of resistance from the schools and communities; the latter has become the predominant focus of integration efforts. In this report, the latter definition is used throughout in discussing the integration process. *Annex 2* provides information on the selection of schools for integration.

The National Benchmark for Integrating Basic Education into Qur'anic Schools developed by the ANFEA's National Commission for Mass Literacy in 2008 identifies integration as "a system of education (formal and non-formal) whereby Qur'anic school children have the opportunity to acquire the skills of reading, writing, computation, life and vocational skills in addition to memorizing the Holy Qur'an and acquiring basic Islamic Religious Knowledge."¹

Qur'anic schools traditionally focus on the recitation and memorization of the Holy Qur'an, while the Islamiyya schools focus on and operate an elaborate curriculum that, in addition to study of the Holy Qur'an, includes study of other religious subjects. According to Masooda Bano's IQTE strategy, "The Islamiyya schools are more recent inventions than the Tsangaya or Ilimi schools. Islamiyya is a modernized schooling system with a formal school structure where the wooden slate for writing is replaced with books used for translation and commentary of the teacher, whereas

¹ ANFEA. (2008). National Benchmark for Non-Formal Education and Integrating Basic Education into Qur'anic Schools. National Commission for Mass Literacy, Adult and Non-Formal Education. Abjua: Government of Nigeria, p. 2.

Qur'anic schools deal only with recitation and memorization of Quran.”²

In practice any Islamic school, Qur'anic, Tsangaya, or Islamiyya in Bauchi and Sokoto, as in other states (notably Jigawa, Kaduna, and Kano), where literacy and numeracy in secular subjects are taught in a formalized pattern is considered **integrated**. The secular subjects that are by integration introduced into these schools include English, mathematics, social studies, primary and integrated sciences, and local languages.

A national curriculum was developed and used in all officially integrated schools with a clear description of quality standards, teaching methods, assessment processes, and time limits to secure credits for graduation. Schools designated as integrated enjoy GON support in terms of supply of instructional materials, teachers, infrastructure facilities, and quality assurance supervision.

2.2 Institutional Context: MDA Mandates, Roles, and Functional Relationship

In Sokoto and Bauchi states, the control, regulation, administration, and management of the integrated schools is shared between several agencies. These include the SUBEB, ANFEA/State Agency for Mass Education (SAME), Arabic and Islamic Education Board (AIEB), MORA, Office of the Director General (DG) Tsangaya, and BASOVCA. *Annex 3* provides information on the type of support offered by each agency, and *Annex 4* shows some key outcomes of the programs.

The major agencies responsible as stated in their legislative mandates are SUBEB, ANFEA/SAME, and AIEB. These agencies control and jointly manage the integrated and non-integrated Qur'anic, Tsangaya, and Islamiyya schools. Out of the 701 schools in Bauchi, ANFEA controls 175 schools with an enrollment of 13,115 (10,075 boys, 3008 girls) and 196 teachers (all males). In Sokoto, the schools are shared among the agencies, but SUBEB, SAME, and AIEB take the largest share in management and control of these schools.

In Bauchi, the MORA and Office of the DG Tsangaya do not have direct control of schools, although they collaborate in mobilization, advocacy, and policy discussions. The Office of DG Tsangaya functions more as a political advisory agency with a mandate to ensure reaching the non-integrated as well as itinerant Qur'anic /Tsangaya schools throughout the communities. This office claims to be in contact with well over 30,000 Tsangaya/Almajiri schools in Bauchi alone and provides a linkage with the Alarammas for support in terms of provision of electric generators, motor cycles, and some stipends of ₦5000 per school. Most of the schools supported through this office are not integrated and do not have plans to become integrated.

However, MORA, which is an off-shoot of the former Office of the Adviser on Education, is more concerned with state-level policies regarding Islamic education.

² Masooda Bano. (2009). Islamiyya, Qur'anic, and Tsangaya Education Board Proposal for the Approval of Kano State Government. ESSPIN/DFID Report No. KN 401

The Ministry's involvement in IQTE is limited to reform policies and review of guidelines on integration of Qur'anic schools. No school is directly controlled by the Ministry apart from its provision of routine financial grants, for which schools apply and are granted some amount ranging from ₦100, 000 to ₦250, 000, and its provision of facilities that offer opportunities for students to acquire vocational skills where necessary. However, MORA is in close collaboration with SUBEB and ANFEA in terms of monitoring and needs assessment.

In Sokoto, only SUBEB, SAME, and AIEB have clear mandates for the IQTE as contained in their edicts and policy documents. The AIEB was established solely for IQTE and saddled with a key mandate for registering all Qur'anic schools. According to Sokoto State's AIEB Edict, AIEB is responsible for "Integrating Western and Islamic education schools, promoting modernization of Qur'anic and Islamiyya schools in the state and providing guidelines for the establishment of new Arabic and Islamic schools."³ At the moment SUBEB controls 87 schools, SAME manages 345 schools, and AIEB manages 688 schools. Any school that qualifies for integration must be registered with the AIEB.

SAME provides support and management of IQTE as an extension of its mandate. SAME's responsibility is to capture both the integrated and non-integrated schools and extend the provision of literacy, numeracy, and vocational skills as well as offer support in terms of teaching and learning materials. A total of 631 IQE schools in Sokoto have been integrated and are being managed by the three organizations: SUBEB, 87; SAME, 543; and MORA, 1.

2.3 School Types and Operational Procedures/Guidelines

By definition, Islamic schools have similar goals but are categorized according to their nature, operating methods, pupils, curriculum type, and methods of instruction. The major types found in both Sokoto and Bauchi states are described below (more information in *Annex 5*).

- **Qur'anic school.** These are the most common Islamic schools, referred to as **Traditional Qur'anic** or **Makarantar Allo**. This type operates in a non-formal mode at an identified venue, mostly in the residence of the malam in charge. The school operates as a day school either in the morning or afternoon or both. The pupils are enrolled from the local communities and neighboring houses to receive daily lessons, while some others come from afar and reside with the malam. The days of instruction are normally Saturdays to Wednesdays. Their curriculum concentrates exclusively on the recitation, memorization, and writing of the Holy Qur'an.
- **Tsangaya schools.** These schools are similar to the traditional Qur'anic/Makarantar Allo and operate in a non-formal mode. They are

³ Sokoto State Law (CAP 7A), 1992. p 76.

sometimes referred to as *Almajiri* or *Cirani* schools (ANFEA Bauchi). These are often described as itinerant or migrant schools, where the malam moves with pupils from one location to another. This type of school normally has poor accommodations or facilities and provisions. Learners may beg for funds for the school or provide some menial or other work in the community, such as selling water or food, sweeping shops, or collecting refuse. The curriculum in this type of school is the Holy Qur'an. According to Bano, "[i]n this system the child is completely handed over to the Malam to live in the Tsangaya outside the parents' community or residential town. This type of Tsangaya has three variations: the bush, the suburbs, and the town. The mobile Tsangaya is based on the belief that one cannot fully concentrate on the Qur'anic studies if he stays in his hometown therefore it is good for the children to travel East to gain higher knowledge."⁴

- **Islamiyya schools.** This is a modernized version of the Qur'anic school, which operates in two ways: the non-integrated or Islamiyya general and the integrated Islamiyya school. The non-integrated Islamiyya /Islamiyya general schools operate conventionally, but their curriculum is limited to the study of religious subjects only. The integrated Islamiyya schools operate with an expanded curriculum that includes secular subjects. These integrated Islamiyya are often considered conventional primary schools with a mixed curriculum of religious subjects and the core national subjects of English, mathematics, science, and social studies. Most integrated Islamiyya schools have infrastructural facilities and receive support from the GON in terms of teachers and instructional materials.
- **Qur'anic Nursery Class (QNC).** This type of school operates only in Sokoto State. Rather than a school, it is a class opened in primary schools where integration becomes problematic, as it requires an agreement with the host community to allow the children to attend two school types at the same time. The QNC combines the two models in one setting, allowing the pupils to attend both the Qur'anic class and conventional classes within the same building. In essence pupils attend Qur'anic studies as in traditional Qur'anic schools before they proceed with the conventional primary school subjects. A local malam is recruited to teach the pupils, and after the lessons they proceed to the study of other secular subjects. Pupils who pass an assessment test after one year are mainstreamed into the conventional integrated class, and those who do not pass continue in the Qur'anic studies. Out of 1,965 schools in Sokoto, 537 schools opened QNCs. The popularity of this model has weakened lately due to its complexity and lack of assessment procedures and resources.
- **The Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) models.** In order to accelerate the integration of Qur'anic and Islamiyya schools, the UBEC introduced a modernized model of the Qur'anic and Islamiyya school system. This process considered all the various types and forms of Qur'anic schools and established three models appropriate for each type as described by the

⁴ Bano, 2009

SUBEB in Bauchi and Sokoto states. In both Sokoto and Bauchi states the three UBEC model types are operated and controlled under SUBEB, as described below.

- Model 1. This is an existing Qur’anic school or an itinerant Tsangaya school where the malam has agreed to integrate by allowing the teaching of secular subjects. Structures and other facilities such as classrooms, hostels, teachers’ houses, beds and bedding, toilets, and laboratories are provided by the GON. The malam serves as the principal of the school, while SUBEB supplies the teachers. The school uses the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum in addition to teaching religious studies.
- Model 2. This is popularly known as the Almajiri Boarding School and solely controlled by SUBEB. This model is an entirely new school established under the control of SUBEB. It operates as a conventional school teaching religious as well as national core subjects. Pupils between the ages of 8 and 10 years are normally selected from other Qur’anic or Tsangaya schools and screened for admission into Model 2 types of schools. The GON provides food, classrooms and seating facilities, toilets, hostels, and teacher housing. There are three such schools in both Bauchi and Sokoto states.
- Model 3. This is the Islamiyya model, popularly called Ma’ahad, originally established to serve the southwestern part of Nigeria. In this model the GON identifies a school and provides teaching and learning materials and an operational grant based on proposals and a detailed action plan submitted by the malam. This arrangement does not interfere with the school curriculum, but creates opportunity for the school to integrate secular subjects for Primary 1 to 6 and to expand from primary to junior secondary school (JSS) and secondary school (SS) levels. The school recruits its teachers and controls curriculum delivery and assessment procedures in collaboration with SUBEB and ANFEA/SAME. There is only one such school in Bauchi and one in Sokoto.

2.4 Curriculum Types and Methods of Delivery

In traditional non-integrated Qur’anic schools, the basic curriculum is the Qur’an: reading the Qur’an, learning the Arabic alphabet, and writing and memorizing verses of the Qur’an. Children are taught through an individualized learning methodology and are often assessed by the malam. Graduation is not fixed, neither is there any time limit imposed on those pupils attempting to graduate. The expectation is that all pupils will be able to complete reading and memorization of the Qur’an as well as to write the verses. In most cases children graduate when they reach a certain age rather than when they master a certain level.

In integrated Qur'anic and Islamiyya schools, there are various versions of the curriculum, some developed by individual states, and the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum recommended for use in all integrated schools. The basic curriculum types used are described below.

- Qur'anic schools /Tsangaya schools. The curriculum being used in these schools in both Bauchi and Sokoto states is the study of the Qur'an exclusively; reading, memorizing, and writing, categorized in stages as follows:
 - Babbaku: Alphabet reading
 - Farfaru: Word formation
 - Hadda: Memorization
 - Sauka: Completion
 - Rubutu: Writing on slate or paper

Children progress individually according to their own speed and understanding. The method is normally an individualized instruction pattern in which each pupil is taught and monitored according to his or her performance. Assessment is carried out by the malam, and a pupil graduates by completion of reading of the Qur'anic text. Instruction typically takes place in the morning, afternoon, and evening, but is flexible to some extent, as each school is controlled by the individual malam and run to accommodate the settlement where the school is located.

- Integrated schools. For integrated schools, effort was made by the GON to harmonize the Curriculum of Integrated Schools due to the numerous variations observed between states. In Bauchi, SUBEB and ANFEA use the UBEC Curriculum for Basic Schools; but in Sokoto SUBEB and SAME use the National Mass Education Commission (NMEC), United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) curricula, while AIEB uses the State Curriculum for Islamiyya Schools that it designed in 2009.

From our discussions with various MDAs and stakeholders, the curriculum types being used are: NMEC, Education Trust Fund (ETF), UNICEF, National Basic Education Commission (NBEC), Arewa House Tsangaya Curriculum, and the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum . There is no clear policy on curriculum usage in all the states. Each MDA is at liberty to use a curriculum it deems appropriate, ensuring that the content satisfies the objectives to be achieved in its mission statement or mandate.

However, interviews conducted confirm that it is generally accepted that the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum is approved for used in all integrated IQE schools across the northern states; both Sokoto and Bauchi approved the implementation of the harmonized curriculum without exception for types of integrated schools.

This harmonized curriculum is designed for three years of study and is broken into two stages of secular subjects and a set of religious subjects.

- **Stage 1:** Basic Literacy, to be covered in one year (approximately 9 months in Sokoto and Bauchi), is equivalent to Primary 1–3 of formal schools and is made up of the following subjects: literacy and numeracy.
- **Stage 2:** Post Literacy, to be covered in two years (approximately 18 months in Sokoto and Bauchi), is equivalent to Primary 4–6 and consists of language skills, mathematics, life skills, social studies, basic science, and health education and vocational skills.
- **Religious subjects:** In addition to the secular subjects provided in the harmonized basic education curriculum, the integrated schools also implement a religious instruction segment, which comprises the teaching of Arabic, the Qur'an, hadith, history, and writing.

However, apart from the harmonized curriculum in use in both states, in Sokoto out of 1,435 IQE schools registered by the AIEB , 688 Islamiyya schools implement the State Islamiyya Schools Curriculum designed by AIEB in 2009. This curriculum is structured to be covered in six years and consists of both secular (English, mathematics, Hausa, Islamic studies, social studies, science, agriculture/home economics, arts, and physical training) and religious subjects (Qur'an, hadith, fiqh, tauhid, sira, tahzib, and Arabic).

The method of delivery and implementation of this curriculum is similar in both Bauchi and Sokoto states. The recommendations in the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum document point to the use of the language of the community at Stage 1, while at Stage 2 both the language of the community and English should be used in instruction. SUBEB and ANFEA in Bauchi follow this recommendation in all 701 schools and vocational centers designated for IQE implementation. However in Sokoto, the delivery varies according to MDAs. The integrated schools under SUBEB and SAME use the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum, but AIEB-controlled schools use the curriculum produced by AIEB in 2009. AIEB approves of the contents of the Harmonized UBEC Curriculum, however, and recommends a flexible policy for any school that wants to use either according to its mission and vision.

There is harmony in the implementation of the teacher pupil hours (contact hours) for the delivery of the integrated curriculum as recommended in the National Benchmark for Integrating Basic Education into Qur'anic Schools. The Benchmark recommends that “the first stage of the curriculum shall be covered in one year and second stage in two years with a minimum of 8 contact hours a week.”⁵ A period of 30 minutes is recommended for effective delivery; however, schools can be flexible with instructional time to accommodate particular circumstances, and implement morning, afternoon, or evening instruction.

⁵ ANFEA, 2008, p. 4.

2.5 Teacher Recruitment and Selection Criteria

Traditional Qur’anic and Tsangaya/Almajiri schools were normally established by a malam, who is the proprietor as well as the teacher. Recruitment therefore does not follow any standard process. However, when such schools begin the process for integration, they are supplied with facilitators and instructors by government agencies involved in IQE. The National Benchmark for Integrating Basic Education into Qur’anic Schools states that malams only require a “substantial knowledge of the Qur’an and other basic forms of Islamic knowledge, a minimum of basic literacy and knowledge of the life skills.”⁶ The National Benchmark also recommends that “the malams who do not possess basic literacy should attend [basic education] classes to make them literate in formal education.”⁷

The teachers supplied by the GON for integrated schools are selected and appointed from the local community. These teachers are already employed by SUBEB, but deployed to teach secular subjects in typical Qur’anic/Tsangaya schools and paid an allowance of ₦2000 in addition to their salary.

For integrated schools, the criteria for recruitment in Bauchi and Sokoto follow the recommendations in the National Benchmark for Integrating Basic Education into Qur’anic Schools:

- Facilitators or teachers are recruited from the local community on the recommendation of the community, assessed and confirmed by Zone Officers. In Bauchi, the Community-Based Management Committee (CBMC) is always consulted in the recruitment process.
- Teachers must have a National Certificate on Education (NCE) with a minimum of three years’ work experience.
- Teachers must agree to work for at least two hours a day.
- Facilitators who lack the minimum qualification or have Senior School Certification Examination (SSCE)/West African Examination Council (WAEC) or Higher Islamic Studies (HIS) credentials are appointed as facilitators but encouraged to pursue the NCE to upgrade their qualifications.⁸

With NEI intervention in IQE, teacher recruitment was improved to target only NCE graduates, while the malams and proprietors of the schools were paid ₦5000 monthly maintenance allowance. Isa Modibbo Qur’anic/Tsangaya School Bauchi is an example of this support. The school was integrated and provided with facilitators/teachers, teaching and learning materials, and vocational skills facilities. The teachers are normally employed by SUBEB to teach secular subjects only and are paid an allowance between ₦5000 and ₦2000 monthly.

⁶ ANFEA, 2008, p. 4.

⁷ ANFEA, 2008, p. 4.

⁸ ANFEA, 2008, p. 4.

Also, teachers are provided regular training in instruction in IQE schools, but there is no record of the number of teachers who have attended the trainings or the skills covered in the training program. SUBEB, ANFEA, and CSOs involved in training teachers follow a program designed by NEI, particularly in the selected intervention schools. This was carried out by CSO subgrantees under the supervision of the NEI, and a follow-up was instituted to ensure effective implementation of the skills.

2.6 Pupil Enrollment Data and Welfare and Support Packages

There are no accurate data on the number of pupils in traditional Qur'anic and Tsangaya schools. However, according to an IQE committee report recorded by SAME in Sokoto (2011), there are well over 1,118,835 pupils in 5,994 schools. AIEB also recorded about 18,951 pupils in only 46 schools (2009). In Bauchi pupil enrollment is not captured, although in discussions the DG Tsangaya reported an estimate of 30,000 schools spread across the state with well over 2.6 million children enrolled.

With the integration process in place, Bauchi ANFEA covers about 13,115 pupils. Based on the data collected and submitted by ANFEA, enrollment is 15,343—8,183 male and 7,160 female—in both integrated and non-integrated schools. MORA has no clear record of pupils, and no data were available on the number of pupils in SUBEB model schools, so only ANFEA has detailed documentation of enrollment.

In Bauchi and Sokoto states, traditional Qur'anic schools receive significant support in the provision of a stipend of ₦5000 monthly to the malams. For SUBEB Model 1 and 2 and other integrated schools supported by ANFEA and SAME, pupils are provided with the following support package:

- Food
- Hostel facilities
- Water and toilets
- School uniforms
- Teaching and learning materials
- Facilities for vocational skills: sewing and knitting machines, weaving, hairdressing, and vulcanizing.

In addition to these, ANFEA (Bauchi) and SAME (Sokoto) also provide other vocational skills training through an apprentice system in which some artisans are employed to teach pupils crafts and other self-supporting trades.

To augment support from government agencies, CSOs also provide additional support to the IQE schools and therefore accelerate the integration process. In Bauchi, the Rahamah Women Development and Federation of Muslim Women Association of Nigeria (FOMWAN), subgrantees of NEI, were engaged to manage 10 IQE centers each. Through their support 2,580 orphans and vulnerable children (OVC) were registered and provided literacy, numeracy, and vocational skills. Likewise a CSO, the Rural Women Development, in Sokoto was also engaged to provide the same kind

of support. It is noted that the activities of these CSOs accelerated community mobilization and sensitization of malams to accept and participate in the integration of their schools. This accounts for much of the success NEI achieved in providing access to IQE pupils.

2.7 School Selection Criteria

The criteria used to select schools to serve as IQE centers or as integrated schools vary according to the type of school to be integrated; however, from discussions with various agencies, the selection follows the standards recommended by UBEC, NMEC, and UNICEF as well as requirements in the National Benchmark for Integrating Basic Education into Qur'anic Schools in Nigeria.

In the states the selection is based on the following summarized considerations.

Bauchi specific:

- Center must be registered with either SUBEB or ANFEA
- Center must have a permanent site owned by the proprietor or community assigned
- Malam/proprietor must be willing to accept the teaching of secular subjects in the center
- Center must establish or agree to establish a Center-Based Management Committee to serve as complementing body to support the IQE center
- Center must have report/recommendation from zonal or Local Government Authority (LGA) officers of ANFEA, OVC Support Team, and SUBEB Quality Assurance Directorate
- Center must be operating in either morning or afternoon
- Agreement must be reached on mainstreaming of pupils of school age to the relevant center, for either primary or junior secondary schooling, after sitting and passing exams (parents must be consulted).

Sokoto specific:

- School must register with AIEB/SAME (Sokoto) and SUBEB
- School must have a permanent location in either urban or rural area for identification and monitoring
- Parents and the malam/proprietor must be willing to accept the teaching of secular subjects
- School must establish a CBMC. This criterion is a follow-up to ensure consent and acceptability of the teaching of the secular curriculum and utilization of the support package available to the schools.
- School must be recommended by SUBED assessment committee, area coordinator, and SAME committee, and team of inspectors from AIEB
- School must open morning or afternoon. Schools that operate at night are not selected.

- School will be visited by designated committee or person to confirm whether the school meets the criteria for integration
- Enrollment age of pupils must not be below 5–6 years at initial enrollment and must not exceed 12 years. The National Benchmark recommends that children above the age of 12 should be enrolled in adult literacy classes; SUBEB: 5–10 years; SAME: 5–18 years; AIEB: 5–20 years.
- Advocacy to traditional and religious leaders. School should advocate with traditional rulers and religious leaders regarding basic education and obtain their consent.
- Outreach to community members and proprietor of the school. School should conduct sensitization visits to community members for awareness and approval.
- Gender: school could be single sex of either sex or coeducational
- Minimum number of students: SUBEB: 40 learners; SAME: 25 learners; AIEB: 35 learners
- Proportion of children attending Qur’anic center and not attending secular schools; that is, a higher proportion of children in that Quranic center are not currently attending secular schools.

3. Conclusion

It is evident that the integration process for Qur’anic /Tsangaya schools is a promising venture and a guarantee for increasing access to education and eradication of illiteracy. Most schools strive to achieve the standard requirements for government partnership and apply for participation in the integration system. However, it is noted that the MDAs closer to the non-integrated schools have been the AIEB and SAME in Sokoto and the ANFEA in Bauchi. The data provided by the agencies was not authenticated by the authors. These agencies control and register most of these schools. In Sokoto the total number of non-integrated schools is 9,463 with the SAME controlling about 57% and integrating about 7.27 (2014), while the AIEB takes responsibility for 15.1% and has integrated about 6.6% (2014). Although the SUBEB recorded 2,034 schools, the integration was slow; only 96 schools so far were integrated (1.01%).

In Bauchi the key MDAs responsible for IQE are SUBEB and ANFEA. These agencies share the same database, training, and welfare plans as well as meet regularly on monitoring. The ANFEA usually conducts assessment tests and provides basic education certificates to pupils. The other agencies—BASOVCA, Office of the DG Tsangaya, and MORA—only provide support to the schools already controlled by SUBEB and ANFEA. It is therefore clear that the integration process of IQE schools in Bauchi is solely within the mandates of the SUBEB and ANFEA.

Moreover, CSO engagement becomes an important element, as seen from the success of the integration work carried out by the NEI subgrantees. The CSOs are community based, have skills for mobilization and sensitization, and ought to be utilized in IQE integration process.

3.1 Challenges

In our discussions with various MDAs and stakeholders (*Annex 6* provides the list of persons contacted for this study), the major challenges in the integration process border around lack of consistent data on the number of schools. The Bauchi Office of the DG Tsangaya has made an effort to capture the number of schools, but due to the schools' itinerant nature, it proved very difficult. The schools migrate seasonally, and sometimes new ones are established without notice.

The CSOs interviewed also agreed that some malams reject the integration because of the selective intervention. Some of them suggest that schools need to be clustered in an intervention program so that each will have the opportunity to share the experience of others and work together.

The DG Tsangaya in Bauchi was of the opinion that lack of sufficient budget to meet schools' needs accounts for much of the apathy from most schools. The Deputy Director AIEB Sokoto also mentioned that the cost of infrastructure provision in integrated schools is high and does not allow consistent GON support, especially in provision of hostels, water and sanitation facilities, and school uniforms. The little money allocated is too insignificant to accommodate the teeming population of IQE pupils.

Although there are documents indicating GON concerns regarding the integration process, there is no clear policy on IQE integration, apart from the expanded mandates of institutions such as SAME, ANFEA, and AIEB. This accounts for the slow process and conflicting procedures in both Bauchi and Sokoto, and in other northern Nigeria communities. Proper intervention must be backed by a clear policy that will anchor credible planning and sound budgetary allocation to tackle the integration process.

Annex 1. Questionnaire

Desk Review on the Integration of Islamiyya, Qur'anic, and Tsangaya schools
Stakeholder's interview Questionnaire

SECTION A: PERSONAL DATA

1. Respondent's name and contact number: _____
2. Position/occupation: _____
3. Basic responsibilities in the said position: _____

SECTION B: INTEGRATION; POLICY AND PROCESSES

1. What do you understand by integration? _____

2. Which types of school need to be integrated, and why? _____

3. How many of such schools have been integrated in the State from xxxx to date?
Can you give us the list of such schools by type, enrolment and by gender, please?

4. Please do explain briefly, what each type of school is all about _____

5. What does an Islamiyya, Qur'anic or Tsangaya school need to become integrated? _____

6. Is there integration policy, either at State or Federal level? If yes, what do they say on integration? Is/are the policy (ies) available? _____

7. Which MDAs is responsible for integration of IQE schools in the State? _____

8. What specific forms of support is provided to an integrated school? _____

9. Are NGOs/CBOs involved in the integration process? If yes, which of such organizations are directly involved and what form of support do they provide? _____

10. Was there any school census on IQE schools? How many schools were captured and by category? _____

11. Which Agency conducted the census and when? _____

12. Who were involved in the exercise (design of instrument, trainings, data collection/entry, analysis and report writing) _____

13. Who funded the census activity? _____

14. Was the census report disseminated and used for any planning purposes? _____

SECTION C: EXSISTING CURRICULA, TEACHERS AND INFRASTRUCTURE

Curriculum requirements

1. Which curriculum/curricula are being used in the integrated IQE schools, What is the source of the curriculum-Federal, State or community etc. _____

2. Which secular and or religious subjects are being offered by the schools?

☐ Islamiyya

☐ Qur'anic

☐ Tsangaya

3. Does the curriculum involve practical skills acquisitions? Which skills are

taught? _____

Operational procedures

1. Operational procedures; when do the schools operate (morning, afternoon, night)?
☐ Islamiyya
☐ Quranic
☐ Tsangaya
2. How many days per week? _____
3. How many hours per day/week? _____
4. How many days /hours are allocated for instruction in secular subjects? _____
5. How many years does it take to cover the curriculum? _____
6. Do the completers proceed to other schools? ☐ YES ☐ NO Which level? _____
7. Is there any form of certification for completers?
☐ Yes
☐ No
8. What is the status of the certificate? _____

Teacher supply/support

1. How teachers are recruited in the IQE schools? _____

2. What is the minimum qualification required of the teachers to teach the core subjects? _____

3. What is the criteria for selecting the teachers? _____

4. How many teachers are there in the IQE sector in the State? ____ Any census data that captures the number per school type and per subject category _____

-
-
5. Are the teachers paid? ☐ YES ☐ NO How much? _____
6. Which agency or MDA is responsible for the payment? _____
7. What form of other support do the teachers get, if any, and by whom? _____

Pupils

1. Is there any data of pupils by school type and by gender? _____
2. Do learners get any additional support, other than the literacy and numeracy skills? If yes, which other forms of support do they get and by who? _____
3. Which other provisions are available for the learners after the lower basic education training? _____
4. Is there any sustainability plan for the continuation of the support to pupils? _____

SECTION D: SELECTION CRITERIA

1. Is there a selection policy on integration of IQT schools? _____
2. How are IQT schools selected for integration? _____
3. How are the learners selected to participate in the literacy program? _____
4. What is the average age of enrolment in these schools? _____
5. Are non-indigene allowed to participation? Who makes the recommendation on the pupils to participate? _____

6. Who is responsible for selecting the time of instruction for the literacy program? Has there been any concern regarding the instruction time conflicting with the religious time of study? If yes, how was it sorted out? _____

7. Are Malams involved in the selection processes? What are their feelings about integration and how do they support it _____

SECTION D: TYPE OF SUPPORT TO INTEGRATED SCHOOLS

1. Which forms of support do the schools receive? _____

2. Who provide such support and what is the frequency? _____

3. In your own opinion, which other additional support will be required by the schools? _____

4. Do you have record of what is being provided? Can you provide the List of items supplied? _____

5. What are the contributions of the other stakeholders? _____

SECTION E: OUTCOMES

1. What are the enrolment, attendance and retention figures (disaggregated by gender)? (2010/11,2011/12,2012/13) _____

2. Was there any impact assessment on the learning outcomes of pupils in any of the schools? _____

—

—

3. What is the performance of the learners? Are there any assessments results to compare progress from the period of intervention to date _____

4. What is the state sustainability plan for integration in the state?__Hospitality

Annex 2. Criteria for School Selection

Criteria for Selection	SUBEB	SAME/ANFEA	AIEB/MORA	BASCOVA
Registration status	Registration with SUBEB IQE Unit	Registration with SAME/ANFEA	Registration with AIEB	Registration with SUBEB/ANFEA
Location	Permanent location in urban or rural area	Permanent location in urban or rural area	Permanent location in urban or rural area	Permanent location in urban or rural area
Curriculum	Acceptance of secular curriculum	Acceptance of secular curriculum	Acceptance of secular curriculum	Acceptance of secular curriculum
Operational period	Morning	Morning/afternoon	Morning/afternoon	Morning/afternoon
Age of children	Age of children 5–10 years	Age of children 5–18 years	Age of children 5–20 years	Age of children 5–6 years
Willingness of parent/ malam	Willingness of parent/ malam/traditional leaders	Willingness of parent/ malam	Willingness of parent/ malam	Willingness of parent/ malam
Recommendation	Recommendation of SUBEB assessment committee/LGEA	Recommendation of the area coordinator and a committee set by SAME	Recommendation of team of inspectors from AIEB	nil
Assessment and certification process	Pupil assessment or mainstreaming into BE	Pupils Assessment for mainstreaming into BE/Skills acquisition centers	Pupils Assessment for mainstreaming into BE in some schools	Pupils Assessment for mainstreaming into skills acquisition
Center-based Management committee (CBMC) formation	Formation of CBMC	Formation of CBMC	Formation of CBMC	
Advocacy to traditional rulers and religious leader	Conduct advocacy visit to traditional and religious leaders for their consent	Conduct advocacy visit to traditional and religious leaders for their consent	Conduct advocacy visit to traditional and religious leaders for their consent	
Sensitization of proprietors of school	Conduct sensitization visit to proprietor of the school	Conduct sensitization visit to proprietor of the school	Conduct sensitization visit to proprietor of the school	
Gender	Boys alone, girls alone, or both	Boys alone, girls alone, or both	Boys alone, girls alone, or both	
Minimum number of student	Forming a class of 40 children	Forming a class of 25 children	Forming a class of 35 children	
Proportion of children attending Quranic center and not attending secular school	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50% of children not attending secular school 60% of the children in the school are not attending secular school 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50% of children not attending secular school 60% of the children in the school are not attending secular school 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50% of children not attending secular school 60% of the children in the school are not attending secular school 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50% of children not attending secular school 60% of the children in the school are not attending secular school

Annex 3. Type of Support Provided by Each Agency

Support Provided	SUBEB	SAME/ANFEA	AIEB	MORA	BASCOVA
Curriculum	UBEC Harmonized/ UNICEF	UNICEF Harmonized plus NMEC Non-formal Education Skills Curriculum	UBEC Harmonized /Syllabus for Islamiyya Schools Sokoto	UBEC Harmonized	Curriculum
Teacher/ Facilitator	NCE, SSCE	NCE, SSCE, Dip	HIS, NCE and Local Arabist, BED	NCE, BSC, Dip, LA	NCE, Dip
Welfare package	Food, hostel, water, toilets, blanket , mosquito nets, provision, uniforms , cosmetics	Primers, b/board, training, remunerations M&E	School uniforms	School uniforms, learning materials	Basic facilities such as medical care, shoes, etc.
Materials	Teaching/learning materials	Teaching/learning materials	Teaching/learning materials	Teaching/learning materials	
Per student costs	Not available	Not available	Not available	Not available	
Stipend for teachers	Monthly salary	Monthly allowance <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ₦2,000 • ₦7,500 	Monthly teacher's allowance ₦5,000	nil	nil
School grants	3- 10m ₦ given to Almajiri integrated Model 3 school (UBEC)	Different grant is given to different categories of schools, and the categories are based on enrollment and size of the school. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Category A School – ₦150,000 • Category B School – ₦120,000 • Category C School – ₦100,000 • Category D School – ₦80,000 	Annual grant – ₦10,000 – 20,000	₦100,000- ₦250,000 in some cases up to 1 million	School grants

Support Provided	SUBEB	SAME/ANFEA	AIEB	MORA	BASCOVA
Allowance to malams	Nil	Monthly allowance: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ₦2,000 • ₦7,500 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ₦5,000 monthly • ₦7,000 	Nil	Allowance to malams
School infrastructure	Provision of hostel, toilet, water, labs, classrooms for Almajiri integrated model schools UBEC	Nil	Construction and renovation of classrooms, toilets, and water facilities	Grants for renovation of infrastructure	School infrastructure

Annex 4. Key Outcomes Associated with Integrated Programs

Outcomes	SUBEB	ANFEA	SAME	AIEB	BOSCOVA
Learners who participate (by gender)	Sokoto ; Total – 46,093 (B23,960; G 22,133)	Total 106,750 (B 52,084; G 54,566)	Total 18,951 (B 8,612; G 10,339)	Learners who participate (by gender)	Sokoto ; Total – 46,093 (B23,960; G22,133)
Learners who participate (by age)	Not applicable	Not available	Not available	Learners who participate (by age)	Not applicable
Percent of enrollment who mainstream into BE	Not applicable	12,367 (12%)	17,434 (92%)	Percent of enrollment who mainstream into BE	Not applicable
Number of certificates issued	Not available	19,977.00	14,121.00	Number of certificates issued	Not available

Annex 5. School Types, Operation Patterns, and Curriculum Types

School Type	Mode of Operation	Location	Subjects	Operational Hours	Methods of Delivery
Qur'anic schools	Day school	Towns and villages	Reading, memorization, and writing of Qur'an verses	Morning and afternoon	Individualized instruction
Almajiri schools	Boarding/day	villages and towns	Reading, memorization, and writing of verses of the Qur'an	Morning, afternoon and night	Individualized instruction
Islamiyya general /Tahfiz schools	Day school	Urban and rural location	Reading, memorization, and writing of verses of the Qur'an	Morning and evening	Conventional patterns
Integrated Islamiyya	Day school	Urban and rural location	Harmonized Curriculum	Morning/ Evening	Conventional pattern
Almajiri integrated UBEC Models 1	Boarding/day school	Urban and rural location	Harmonized Curriculum	Morning/ Evening	Conventional pattern
Almajiri integrated UBEC Model 2	Boarding/day school	Urban/ rural location	Harmonized Curriculum	Morning/ Evening	Conventional pattern
Almajiri integrated UBEC Model 3		Rural location	Harmonized Curriculum	Morning/ Evening	Conventional pattern

Annex 6. Persons Contacted

	Name	Position	organization
1	Abdulaziz B Saibu	State Cordinator Almaiiri Education Prog	SUBEB Bauchi
2	Mohammad Bello Jibrin	Coordinator IQTE	SUBEB Bauchi
3	Hauwa Abubakar T/Balewa	State Director	ANFEA Bauchi
4	Ahmed Ibrahim Jahun	Director Literacy	ANFEA Bauchi
5	Mal Yusif Hussein Lifidi	Ag Director, IQTE	BASOVCA,Bauchi
6	Yusif Ado	Ag DPRS	MORA, Bauchi
7	Mal Isa Modibbo	Alaramma	Isa Modibbo Quranic Tsangaya school Bauchi
8	Aishatu Ibrahim Kilishi	Education Committee	FOMWAN
9	Habiba Mohammad Damina	Health Committee	FOMWAN
10	Fatima Mohammad	Z/Coordinator	FOMWAN
11	Sheik Ali Dahiru Usamn Bauchi	Director General	Tsangaya Directorate Bauchi
12	Hadiza Musa	Prog Manager	Rahama Women Development
13	Elmina Maina	Prog Director	Rahama Women Development
14	Miriam Iliya	Executive Director	Rahama Women Development
15		Executive Director	SAME SokotoState
16	Umar Hassan Tureta	Prog Officer Mass Literacy	SAME SokotoState
17	Mohammad Tambari Umar	Data Processing Officer	SAME SokotoState
18	Zaki Abubakar	Secretary	SAME SokotoState
19	Abdullahi Abbas	D/ Executive Secretary	AIEB, Sokoto
20	Ibrahim Salisu Katume	D/ Community Services	AIEB, Sokoto
21	MohammadUmar Boyi	Desk Officer IQE	SUBEB Sokoto
22	Bello Umar Auta	Director	MORA Sokoto
23	Yusif Abdu	Prog Manger	Rural Women & Youth Development Sokoto
24	Saadu Labbo	M&E officer	Nagarta Community Health & Gender Educ Initiative , Sokoto
25	Usman Kokoshe	Alaramma	Kokoshe Quranic school Sokoto
26	Sadiq Ilela	Research Coordinator	RTI RARA Bauchi
27	Aliyu Abdullahi Isa	Research Coordinator	RTI RARA Sokoto

	Name	Position	organization
28	ZahrauMaishanu	Prog Assistant	RTI RARA Sokoto